SAVING THE OLD MARKET OF A DIVIDED CITY
Assessing HRC regeneration project in the occupied section of Hebron city
分割された都市におけるオールドマーケットの保存
ヘブロン市占領区域におけるHRC再生プロジェクトの評価

Nisreen ZAHDA* and Yuichi FUKUKAWA**
ザヒーレン ザッダ，福 川 有一

Hebron is a city with an old core that has been subjected to intense evacuation policies since the Israeli military occupation in 1967. In 1996 the HRC (Hebron Rehabilitation Committee) started a rehabilitation project in the occupied section of Hebron to save its old center particularly the Old Market zone from deterioration. The purpose of this research is to assess the impact of HRC project on the Old Market taking into consideration the political pressures and the uncommon urban settings. Based on field survey and (conducted) interviews, the research found the following: First, the direct restoration process has a humble positive impact on the enterprises located in the Old Market. Second, other factors besides the political one have intensified the present poor conditions. Third, HRC tenant system for inhabiting abandoned residential units has succeeded in attracting new residents, but these selected residents have had a minor influence on the economy of the Old Market.

Keywords: Inner City Rehabilitation, Historic Conservation, Local Economic Assessment, Military Occupied Area, Hebron City
中心市街地再生，歴史保存，地域経済活動の評価，占領地，ヘブロン市

1. Introduction
Regenerating inner city areas has been widely researched. However, few studies have dealt with cases subjected to uncommon political conditions, which have been not scarce in the world. This study tackles the urban regeneration of the old center of Hebron City in the Palestinian Territories. This center has been, intentionally, marginalized physically and virtually for more than 60 years of Israeli military occupation which has succeeded in isolating it -the old center-from its urban context in mid 1990s. With the absence of national conservation policies and effective governmental structure in Palestine (Feith, 1997) and working in an unsettled urban context with a limited authority of an ad hoc organization, HRC (Hebron Rehabilitation Committee) started rehabilitating the abandoned Old City in the occupied section of Hebron in 1996. Protecting the historical heritage and the collective memory of the Palestinians has been the first aim of HRC (HRC, 2007). Measuring the project success in implementing its targets raises various difficulties in isolating the political influence from the priorities and adopted policies of HRC as well as its achievements. However, the success of any urban regeneration model requires selecting measures originated from the needs of the local context and from what this context can offer (Blakeley, 1995). After ten years of launching HRC project, primary results have shown differences between social and economic rehabilitation performance. The purpose of this research is to evaluate the impact of the HRC project on upgrading the local economy of the Old Market in Hebron Old City taking into account the political pressures and the various obstacles facing HRC and to cast light on the efficiency of the adopted measures in rehabilitation on both economic and social levels.

2. Objectives and methodology:
Study area: In order to assess the impact of HRC project on the local economy of the Old City of Hebron, the Old Market area is to be investigated mainly for three reasons: first, the rehabilitation process has progressed the most in this zone in terms of restoration of shops and factories as well as rehabilitation of residential buildings and infrastructure. Secondly, the area is located near the Israeli Settlements and has been subjected to many political pressures. Rehabilitating this zone has remained a priority for HRC and therefore, major efforts and large part of the fund have been spent particularly on this zone. Thirdly, at the time of investigation, this zone was accessible to Palestinian pedestrians and therefore it was possible to carry out the site investigation more easily than other adjacent blocked zones of economic importance as well.
Analysis methodology: The analysis will be divided in two parts: first, assessing the impact of the direct restoration of the buildings where the industrial and commercial spaces (from now on I will refer to them as enterprises, a phrase used by HRC) are located. Since this requires investigating both opened and closed enterprises, the data concerning the closed enterprises was collected from the Old Market representatives –El-Mukhtar in Arabic - and managers of nearby opened enterprises to assure its accuracy. In addition, a questionnaire was used with the managers of the opened enterprises concerning HRC activities. Second part focuses on analyzing the impact of the rehabilitation of residential buildings on the local economy (indirect intervention assessment). A sample

* Ph. D. candidate, Graduate School of Architecture, Chiba University
** Prof., Graduate School of Architecture, Chiba University
of new residents was selected based on HRC tenant system for this study. The related data of this part was collected from HRC main office with the permission of the Social Head Office. Moreover, the paper will examine the efficiency of the policies and measures adopted by HRC. A number of interviews were conducted in May/June 2007 with HRC’s staff concerning the policies and process of restoration.

3. Context:
Hebron (Al-Khalil in Arabic) is one of the oldest cities in Palestine located 32 km to the south of Jerusalem (Fig.1a). Hebron Governorate is 997 km² with 543 880 inhabitants; around 166,000 of them live inside the city (PCBS, 2006). The city is built on several hills and valleys, most of which run north to south. The Old City of Hebron is located in eastern part of Hebron Valley. The Old City has a remarkable stone architecture dating back to the 18 century and luckily it still retains 99% of its historical

Fig. 1 Hebron Maps (Resource: (a) PASSIA, 2007. (b) GIS Division, Hebron Municipality, 2007. (c) UN, 1997)

Fig. 2 Restriction on movement of Palestinians and opening of businesses in Hebron Old City over the years. (Resource: B’Tselem, 2007)

Fig. 3 The rehabilitation activities by HRC until April 2007 showing in addition the Israeli settlements and checkpoints (Resource: HRC Engineering Office, HRC, 2007)
buildings to this day (Tukil, 1998). Most of its buildings surround the Abraham Mosque 'The Cave of the Patriarchs', the holiest religious spot in Hebron. A main axis called Suq Al-Qasaba crosses the Old City where most of the enterprises (shops, factories, storages, etc) are located. The residential Quarters, where extended families used to live, are formed of clustered courtyards houses connected by a traditional organizational pattern of winding alleys attaching the quarters with the Suq.

In 1967 Hebron was occupied by Israel and since then its original residents have been under intense evacuation pressures. The Israeli policy has been discouraging Arabic people from staying there by various means such as closing shops, limiting traffic, prolonged curfews, and blocking main entrances under the pretext of security reasons to protect newly-built Israeli settlements in the old city, these settlements house 200-400 Israeli settlers (LRC, 2007). As a result, the population of the Old City declined from 10,000 people in 1967 to only 1,500 people in 1997 (HRC, 2006). 85% of the houses were abandoned; their residents either left their houses and moved out or rented them to poorer relatives. With the continuity of these political odds and as the city urban boundaries grew, the center of Hebron city was gradually dragged towards the northern west side marginalizing further the Old City (Figure 1.b)².

Furthermore, in 1997 the Palestinian Liberation Organization and Israel signed Hebron Protocol (Fig.1.c), which divided the city into two sections: H1 and H2, where the Old City is located, includes 20% of the city area and remained under Israeli Occupation. The eastern part of Hebron City has been isolated and Palestinians are prohibited from crossing through the Old City to reach the new center on the west side. This resulted in more restrictions in business activities in H2 (for more details see B’Tselem reports 2003 & 2007). The Old City center was the home of the wholesale market, thousands of small shops and the main industrial zone. In 2000, 1610 enterprises were located in H2, 1000 of which were closed, one third of which by military decrees⁴ (LRC, 2007). Figure 2 shows closed areas and the restrictions on the movement of Palestinians.

4. HRC activities in Old City:

The early steps for saving the Old City started in 1988 when Hebron University Graduates Union Committee (UGUC), a local charitable organization, funded the early research and documentation of the historic fabric. However, the turning point was in 1996, when HRC (Hebron Rehabilitation Committee) was formed to rehabilitate the Old City, to face Israeli settling expansion, and to encourage people to return back. The total estimated cost of the project is around 50 million dollars; until 2006 HRC received around 15 million dollars from different donors⁵ without any contribution from the owners or the tenants of the rehabilitated units. HRC work has been subjected to many pressures from the...
occupation authorities. The fear of property seizing by Israel has influenced the restoration policy of HRC. According to Dandess, a HRC architect, the restoration priorities are divided into three levels: first, inhabited or abandoned buildings adjacent to Israeli settlements (even if they need only partial restoration), second, buildings which are structurally under risk, and third, the rest of other historical buildings located in Old City. The general restoration policy is based on minimum interventions to make the buildings structurally and functionally adequate for modern use. The boundary of HRC activities covers an area of 270,000 m² with 85,000 m² of ground floor area (Fig. 3). HRC has undertaken large-scale projects including the restoration of buildings, streets, open spaces, and public infrastructure. HRC rehabilitated the main old fabric ‘Old Market’, Salaymeh neighborhood (full restoration), Al-Shaikh and Qitun neighborhoods (Partial restoration), and more than 40 buildings in Tal Rumaideh. Accordingly, the project can be divided to four main categories based on the type of rehabilitation:

1. The rehabilitation of the residential quarters: Between 1996 and May 2007, 756 units have been restored or undergoing restoration. 540 residential units were restored and remained residential in use, 238 of the units have been already inhabited before restoration and 302 units were abandoned before restoration. In addition, 19 restored units have been reused for other purposes (Table 1). HRC has developed a tenant system-to be elaborated in section 5.- which has succeeded in attracting new residents (HRC, 2007). In 2007, the population of the old town rose to approximately 4000 people (Hamdan, 2007).

2. The restoration of enterprises in the Old Market: There are more than 650 shops and factories located in the Old Market which is divided into 4 main sub-markets (Fig. 5): Suq Al-Qasaba, Suq Al-Laban, Suq Al-Eskafeh, and Suq Al-Attaren. The area is proposed to be an urban village where several of functions (schools, governmental offices, cultural, etc) co-exist with one another (Fig. 4). The rehabilitation started in 1998 when 25 of the enterprises were restored in Suq Al-Eskafeh and continued to other sections of the Old Market. However, HRC stopped restoring more enterprises giving priorities to residential quarters because of the limited fund.

It's important to notify here that rehabilitating the residential units and restoring the enterprises located underneath have been recognized as two separate projects. Rehabilitating upper floors does not necessary imply that the commercial and industrial spaces located underneath would be restored correspondingly. This is related to the complexity of the socio-economic structure of the Old City in terms of ownership and rental patterns of both working and living spaces. The residential space of the Old City was divided into few main but large quarters for extended families while the market was divided according to the type of industry, which -the industry- in some cases was related to certain families. Also, some sections of the Old market are one-floor buildings.

3. The infrastructure rehabilitation: It was opened to tender in 1998. Large parts of the project have been finished. Rehabilitating the deteriorated infrastructure, which is 150 years old, included extending electricity cables, telephone cables, fire-prevention system, and re-tiling pedestrian streets.

4. Creating communal open spaces and parking areas within the old fabric: only one major open area in the Old Market close to Suq El-Laban has been transformed into a green park for the locals. According to the proposed plan two other green areas will be created as they are still in the planning phase (Fig. 4).

5. The assessment of HRC project impact on the local economy of the Old Market area:
5.1. Direct impact assessment (the restoration of enterprise):

In order to study the impact of restoration on the present condition of

---

Fig. 6. The analysis of the enterprises located in the selected study zone in Old Market, 2007
enterprises, a survey was carried out in May/June 2007 covering 225 enterprises located in the Old Market where most the restoration took place (Fig. 5). At the time of survey, the distinguishing between complete and partial restoration in the case of the closed enterprises was difficult due to the loss of HRC early work archive. Therefore, in this analysis both types are considered 'restored.' In the case of inconsistent data of any enterprise, it is recorded as unknown.

1. The present conditions of the enterprises: Out of the 225 surveyed enterprises, only 50 enterprises were opened in 2007. Only 5 of these 50 enterprises re-opened with new managers (Fig. 6 map 1). In addition, 66% of the enterprises were closed before the escalation of restriction measures in 2000. This means other factors besides the political one have contributed in the closure of the Old Market.

2. Restoration impact on enterprise condition: Out of the 140 restored (partially or completely) only 33 are open. Also 17 of the not-restored enterprises are opened which represent 34% of the opened in general (Fig. 6 map 2). Moreover, 32% of the enterprises located under rehabilitated floors are opened and only 11% of the enterprises located in one-storey buildings are opened (Fig. 6 map 3). This may imply that rehabilitating upper floors has positive impact on enterprises located underneath. However, since the majority of the upper floors – excluding the buildings Israeli army prevented from being restored by HRC – in the Old Market are rehabilitated, it is difficult to conclude whether the existence of upper floors has this positive impact or whether rehabilitating them has maintained the use of enterprises located underneath. More comparative investigation on other zones is needed to clear this point.

Based on the previous data, it is clear that the restoration of enterprises has a weak positive impact on the present conditions of the enterprises. Other factors along with the political factor have intensified the closure of the Old Market. Therefore, the influence of the legal issues concerning the ownership patterns, the socio-economic character, and type of industry of these enterprises are analyzed:

3. The relation between the enterprise present conditions and their ownership patterns: 79% of these enterprises are still rented and not vacant in the legal terms (Fig. 7). In addition, 43% of their managers have created other alternatives (relocated or changed the industry) outside the Old City (Fig. 8). This can be related to the typography of the tenancy system. According to the Palestinian law concerning real state tenure regulation, the tenure right is inherited as far as the tenants or one of his inheritors keep paying the rent (Sarhan, 1996). Most of these enterprises have been rented for more than 50 years at same rent cost –most of these enterprises rent cost is less than 15 dollars a year. This means that these enterprises are in stagnant state due to the passivity of their managers. There is no obligation on the managers of the restored but closed enterprises to re-open in return for the restoration cost, not to mention the fact that HRC has not yet created up to this moment effective policies to overcome such an obstacle.

4. The relation between the managers of enterprises and Old City residents: more than 67% of the managers who are either closing or opening their enterprises live outside the Old City at the present time (Fig. 7). The weak relation between Old City residents and its local economy, even after rehabilitation, may explain why a large number of shops are still closed, taking also into account the fact that the Old City non-residents were banned by Israeli Authorities from entering the Old City for months during 2000 and 2003 (B’Tselem, 2007).

5. The relation between Type of industry and closure: By looking at the Fig. 9 and 10, manufacture-related enterprises show the poorest results comparing to other business activities. Tourism related business shows a better performance. Despite the small number of tourist business, they have a strong presence. It can be noticed clearly when walking along Al-Qasaba Street where the managers use the surrounding walls to show different products, which have added an aesthetic flavor to the street, besides playing traditional music and exhibiting hand made industries for tourists. HRC has encouraged tourist groups to tour the Old City with local guides and converted a Turkish bath to a museum known as Al-khalil Museum (see Fig. 5). Unfortunately the museum was closed by Israel in 1997. The existing infrastructure and services still are insufficient for lucrative tourism. For instance, HRC should provide essential services like public toilets, restaurants, street signs, etc.

5.2. Indirect intervention assessment (HRC Tenant system and the impact of newly selected residents on local economy):

The HRC has been optimistic that a critical mass of the area residents will sustain the new activity. Logically, new residents will add to the local economy of the Old City. In order to encourage new residents to come and live in the Old City, HRC has created a Tenant System for solving the legal issues related to ownership complexities in order to rehabilitate the residential units and make them ready and attractive. This system has influenced the type of families that re-inhabited 43% of the restored units. In fact, until May 2007 and through this system, 302 vacant units have been re-occupied. One hundred twenty-nine of these 302 units where re-inhabited by residents selected by HRC. In the Old Market area, 123 units were re-occupied by the owners or their relatives and 107 units were re-inhabited by these selected residents (Fig. 11).

The tenant system policy: The residential compounds are composed of several units asymmetrically surrounding multi-level courtyards. In case of a small building where the owners (or their relatives) still live, HRC restores the building for free without forcing them to move out temporarily so as to carry out the work. In the case of large compounds, the owners are consulted in the division of the compound; HRC rents one-third of the restored compound for five years.
for making it available for newcomers. In the case of the abandoned buildings where none of owners agrees to move back in, HRC has the right to rent the full compound in return for the restoration cost. After the reconfiguration and the restoration process of the building are finished, HRC rents its ‘share’ with no charges for a fixed period of time for selected residents. In addition, the residents benefit from various incentives such free health insurance, subsidized electricity and water, and tax reduction. HRC selection criteria give priority to young married couples having many children with limited budget. Also they should have no criminal records, no real estate properties, and a good education level is preferred (HRC, 1997).

5.2.2 Survey and analysis: to investigate whether these selected residents have a positive impact on the local economy, a sample of 54 units where these selected residents live was used. The analyzed data focus only on the type and work location of the head of the family. Therefore, results may not be comprehensive since their patterns of consumption were not investigated nor the impact of the rest of other new residents. Anyway, the analyzed sample sheds light on the efficiency of HRC system in improving the workforce in the Old City.

5.2.3 Discussion: Twelve of the selected residents out of the 54 are unemployed and live on aids from different local and international organizations (Fig. 12). Also, Figure 13 shows that only 13% of them work inside the Old City. This means that the new residents have added little to the local workforce in this zone. HRC has recognized that a major problem in the area is the high rate of unemployment, so it favors the residents of H2 area when it needs to recruit workers (HRC, 2007). However, the tender (bid) system used by HRC in carrying out the restoration projects has undermined the available job opportunities (especially for the construction workers who represent more than one third of the sample). No specific obligations on the contractors who win the bid are imposed when hiring workers. This section concludes that the selected residents have minor positive impact on upgrading the local economy of the Old City.

6. Opinions of the managers of the restored and opened enterprises:

Twenty-two interviews were carried out with the managers of the restored and working enterprises in May 2007. The sample represents 46% of such enterprises. The purpose of the interviews was to make a swift evaluation of HRC activities from the managers' point of views. The results (Fig. 14) show that: two thirds of the interviewees agreed that the restoration has a positive impact on the economic performance of their enterprises. But less than half showed high satisfaction with HRC activities, and two thirds described the HRC activities and its services in the Old Market as "not enough". Their complaints can be summarized as follows:

a) General complaints:
- Lack of safety measures against theft and crimes. This has forced managers to keep few products in their enterprises particularly in the one-floor buildings. Many of their enterprises are almost empty and underutilized.
- There is no a clear plan for the area's economy. All managers agreed that HRC succeeded in the residential side of the project, but has neglected its economic side.
- Problems with the new residents and lack of trust were clear. Many of the managers accused the new residents of the theft and crimes that have occurred in the Old Market. Qaswasi, the Head of the Engineering Office at HRC, admits that the absence of social integration programs for the new residents to adjust and build bridges of trust with the original residents has widened the gap between them.

b) Complaints about the restoration activities:
- The restoration was partial in some cases; only by changing the wooden doors or painting them if they were originally made of metal.
- Low quality of finishing is prevalent: most of the contractors are regular construction workers without sufficient architectural background. Also the majority of HRC engineering staff belongs to civil engineering (HRC, 1998). This has undermined the aesthetic aspects in the restoration process.
- There is no continuous and sustained maintenance for the restored enterprises. In some restored units the plaster of the ceiling is already cracking down. It is supposed that every two years a maintenance operation be carried out but the HRC failed to do that due to the limited fund.
- Restoration projects have disturbed the already struggling pedestrian flow. For example, it took two years to restore the enterprises and the infrastructure in Al-eskafeh Street.

7. Conclusion:

This research has tackled the project of Hebron rehabilitation Committee (HRC). This project has made progress under the Israeli Occupation Authorities and has been subjected to political pressures, which have rendered the assessment of HRC's work a difficult task. The purpose of this research is to evaluate HRC project on the local economy of the Old Market. The results of the research were based on field survey and interviews - taking into consideration the
fact that the limited authorities for Palestinians over this zone have undermined HRC efforts in implementing its targets. On one side, the results show that the direct restoration has a humble positive impact on the enterprises located in the Old Market. On the other hand, more research is needed to conclude whether rehabilitating the residential units in the upper floors has a positive impact on the enterprises located below. In addition, not only the political pressure has played part in the Old Market closure but also other factors have intensified the poor business environment in that zone. The passivity of the managers of the closed enterprises, the tenure system, the weak relation between the residents and the local economy, and certain types of industries all have undermined the HRC restoration efforts and have not been solved by HRC yet. HRC tenant system for inhabiting abandoned residential units has succeeded in attracting new residents, but these selected residents have a minor influence on the Old Market economy in terms of workforce. Based on the opinion of the managers of the restored and opened enterprises, HRC project has positive impact on their business but it neglected the role of social integration programs and safety measures as well it has technical problems concerning the restoration. Finally, taking into consideration the various obstacles facing HRC (Political, legal, financial, social, and physical), the HRC’s work has introduced a pivotal model for other cities on national level and other politically unsettled urban contexts and working in odd circumstances in order to save the historical heritage of a place.

Notes
1. The interviews with the Engineering Head Office Khalid Qawasmi, two field engineers, Hilmı Marge and Naha Dandere, and Social researchers Nuhu Abu Sara and Adel Awad.
2. The discontinuity in the 2005 city border growth is due to the existence of two Israeli Settlements: Bet Hagay and Nahal Anar. This zone is classified as C which is an area under the control of Israel.
3. People in Palestine still depend on small stores in their daily shopping. The presence of supermarkets in Hebron has not cause the declination of the traditional market.
4. In 2000 al-Aqsa Intifada started. The were many restrictions on Palestinian travel inside and outside their cities.
5. HRC was established by the ex-president of the Palestinian Authority Yasir Arafat. The Committee has 13 members including the Minister of Transportations and officials from other ministries and NGO representatives as well as members from UGCC. The executive arm of HRC is the engineering office which is responsible for the entire planning and restoration process. It has 32 permanent employees and dealing with more than 20 local contractors. The office has two divisions: an administration office and a technical office and both are located in the Old Market area.
6. The donors include public and international organizations; Palestinian Authority (21% share), Saudi Development Fund, The Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development, Spanish Agency for International Cooperation of the Spanish Ministry of Foreign Affairs(AEC), Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA), and others.
7. Such as arresting construction workers in the restoration zone and the military orders of demolishing 20 historical buildings in the Old City for making new roads for Israeli settlers. In some cases the workers had to live in the buildings going under restoration to finish their work.
8. In the late 1990s, HRC main office located in the Old Market was robbed. Most of the early work archive(digital and documentation data) were lost.
9. The Museum was burned by Israeli settlers in 1997 only after few months of opening.

References
7. HRC, Social Division. 1997. The selection criteria for the new residents.

和文要約
イスラエルの占領政策により活力を失ったパレスチナの古都・ヘブロンの中心市街地(オールドマーケット)では、1996年にヘブロン再生委員会(HRC)が組織され、町並みを保存しつつ中心市街地の再生を図るプロジェクトが行われてきた。本研究の目的は、政治的に困難な状況に置かれた歴史的市街地の保存・再生という大きな課題を考えるにあたり、ヘブロンにおけるHRCプロジェクトの評価を行うことである。調査では、とくに、中核の商店街や工場からなるマーケット(通り)の再生に焦点をあて、一定の成功をおさめつつある住宅の再生(居住者の回帰)とその関連を採った。その結果、住宅が再生された街区では商店への好影響が観察されるものの、全体としては居住者の回帰がそのままマーケットの再生につながらない実態があるべきだった。

(2007年9月10日受理受稿，2007年12月5日採用決定)