theatrical vocabulary is taken over in Melnikoff's analysis of Chapter 2, and the subject of Gieskes's discussion on James IV—self-consciousness of Greene as dramatist—is also the major concern in Reynolds and Turner's interpretation of Friar Bacon and Friar Bungay. Further, Mentz, Newcomb, and Maslen share a mutual interest in how Greene represented "Greene's" penitence, albeit in different senses. Also, Greene's self-positioning in the late-1580s literary market is a topic shared by Maslen and Wilson.

Overall, Writing Robert Greene: Essays on England's First Notorious Professional Writer has completely remapped the current Greene studies. The collection is an essential and resourceful achievement in Elizabethan literary-cultural studies as well as Greene scholarship. If there is any room for improvement in the work, the volume does not tackle three phases of Greene's prose career directly: (1) the early euphuistic romances such as Mamillia (1580 and 1583) and Gwyndonius (1584); (2) the cony-catching pamphlets (1591-92); and (3) the satires such as A Quip for an Upstart Courtier (1592). Nonetheless, this volume of substantial and cogent research is certainly insightful and rewarding, and its omissions merely supply subjects for further inquiry into a more full-length picture of Greene as a professional writer. We look forward to reading succeeding publications.

Edith Snook, Women, Beauty and Power in Early Modern England: A Feminist Literary History


Reviewed by ODAWARA Yoko, Chukyo University

From Edith Snook's point of view, female beauty which occupies a central place in the 16th century literary culture of early modern England is predominantly described by the male imagination for the male imagination. Without mentioning much about Petrarch or those who wrote sonnets inspired by Petrarch including Sir Thomas Wyatt, Henry Howard, earl of Surrey, Sir Philip Sidney, Edmund Spenser, or William Shakespeare, she turns instead to works by women of this period: texts about beauty that survive in print and manuscript—works of fiction, drama, verse, maternal advice, letters, chronicles, and domestic writing such as recipes and accounts in her Women, Beauty and Power in Early Modern England: A Feminist Literary History. Anglo-American criticism has been preoccupied with politics and power over the past three decades, and her book is in the current trend including the feminist point of view. This book
shifts focus somewhat from beauty's literary tradition to its practices with three sections on cosmetics, clothing and hair.

Early modern beauty is a "theoretical, conservative" concept. In Italy, France, Spain, Germany and England, the basic aesthetic was the same: "white skin, blond hair, red lips and cheeks, and black eyebrows". Even after Petrarch's influence on English poetry fades, the codified physical attributes of female beauty remain entrenched in early modern England. For both men and women in the period, "getting dressed—putting on clothes and making the skin and hair appropriate—was far from trivial" (p. 7). People understood their place in the society and showed inward identity in their outward appearance and dressing. The focus in this book is on middle-and upper-class women, "for they had the economic means both to participate in beauty culture and to gain access to the literacy that allowed them to use its literary forms to record their ideas" (p. 8).

This book is divided into three sections, each comprising two chapters. Part One is on cosmetics, and rethinks the cosmetic practices in the period as dangerously unhealthy. Chapter I focuses on recipes for products which make the face fair by removing freckles, pimples, redness and other blemishes. Chapter 2 draws attention to the political structures and the cultural evaluation of fair (that is, white and unblemished) skin, and surveys how "fair beauty is a privilege of class — of an aristocratic race". Part Two uses women's fiction, advice and account books to further the discussion of women's approach to dress. Chapter 3 delves into "relationship between clothes and subjectivity" in Lady Mary Wroth's prose romance The Countess of Montgomery's Urania (1621) and a manuscript account book by Margaret Spencer. Chapter 4 turns to theorizing the public role of children's dress in the works of maternal advice by Elizabeth Jocelin and Brilliana Harley, Lady Harley. Part Three examines literary representations of hair, maintaining the attention to the social functions of beauty by exploring how hair marked and produced political and social power. Chapter 5 examines the function of hair in cross-dressing stories: The Countess Montgomery's Urania by Lady Mary Wroth and "Assaulted and Pursued Chastity" by Margaret Cavendish, Duchess of Newcastle upon Tyne. Chapter 6 looks at the different approaches that Anne Clifford, Countess of Pembroke, Dorset and Montgomery took to hairstyling when she was a young maid and when she was a widow.

Snook's cover image, a seventeenth-century needlework picture of "Susanna and the Elders" from the apocryphal thirteenth book of Daniel, shows Susanna in clothes, and more surely than other paintings in the same theme, asserts Susanna's chastity and virtue. However, it is not recognizable as the story of Susanna at a glance. If we
think that the story concerns men's desire, Susanna depicted in the nude by Tintoretto, Veronese, and Carracci, or even the terrified, exposed Susanna painted by Rubens and Van Dyck may be more natural to readers. The cover image tells implicitly that this book is written from a feminist point of view.

In Chapter 1 "In 'Beautifying Part of Physic': Women's Cosmetic Practices in Early Modern England", Snook mentions that satirical treatment of women's face painting in plays by Shakespeare, Jonson or Webster gives an impression that women were victims of their own desires, as they destroyed their health by decorating their faces with cosmetics containing lead and mercury. However, she argues, women were not acting against medical advice, and women's recipes including mercurial cures were commonly utilized in the period. She shows that they were working within a rational model of appropriate medical practice, quoting phrases from contemporary books including *The Great Herbal*. Women's recipes and men's recipes were similar, and their aim was "to cherish and maintain the native Beautie thereof". *The English Man's Treasure* (1586) by Thomas Vicary, Sergeant Surgeon to Henry VIII, has a water that will "make the face faire and the breath sweete", a "remedie for a red face or red nose". John Partridge's *The Treasurie of Commodious Conceits* (1591) and Nicholas Culpeper's *The English Physician* (1652) have similar recipes. The fairness signals health, as well as beauty. Both face waters and pomatums are evident in popular herbal: John Gerard's *The Herball or General Historie of Plants* (1633) or John Parkinson's *Paradisi in Sole Paradisus Terrestris*, (1629). Lady Frances Catchmay's manuscript recipe collection entitled *Booke of Medicins*, which is a bequest to her children and includes 23 products for the face, and Margaret Baker's medical and culinary recipes c.1672—a receipt book, each have a recipe which employs mercury. Female practitioners who were excluded from institutional education could never be qualified to use mercury. Lady Ranelagh's alchemical recipe collection contains the only recipe Snook has found for paint. Her brother lived at her house and conducted experiments with mercury. She is described as a practitioner of experimental chemistry, and recipes in her collection employ alchemical symbols.

Snook also shows that fair skin and red skin are attached to configuration of cultural power. For the author of *Artificiall Embellishments*, to have scabby skin is to risk being identified as lower class. To have fair skin is to avoid such ready designation, and cosmetics potentially enable the transgression of class distinctions marked in appearance. When blemishes are regarded as products of blood, fair face is linked to anxieties about female chastity in a world where lust is connected to an excess of blood.
In Chapter 2 “‘Soveraigne Receipts’, Fair Beauty and Race in Stuart England”, Snook turns to three texts which confer authority on the definition of beauty as fair and healthy to examine the strategies by which fair beauty becomes powerful and normative: Queen Henrietta Maria’s last masque Salmacida Spolia (1639/40) by William Davenant, The Queens Closet Opened (1655) printed as Queen’s recipe collection, and Aphra Behn’s posthumously published prose narrative The Wandering Beauty (1698), which rewrites heroic tales of Charles II’s escape from Worcester in 1651 through a well-born Royalist maid. These three texts polemically align the Stuart monarchy and its royalists with fantasies of fair skin to advocate “a harmonious social order based on absolute, natural and indestructible class privilege” (p. 10).

Snook includes Salmacida Spolia and The Queens Closet Opened in women’s writing because critics have positioned Queen Henrietta Maria as a producer of masques and “through her performances the aesthetics of the Stuart Court” (p. 38), and the Queen was also a collector of recipes. These texts together present fairness as “an attribute of a powerful, authoritative elite who will maintain a social order structured by class and hereditary monarchy”.

In Salmacida Spolia, the King and Queen’s Twelfth Night Masque of 1639/40, the Queen plays herself, dressed in Amazonian costume. Snook explains the masque as “a tale of the triumph of civility over barbarism” (p. 41), and Salmacis is a stream on Halicarnassus in Asia, taken by the Greeks but perpetually attacked by barbarians of fierce and cruel natures. By drinking the sweetness, the barbarians “were reduced of their own accord to the sweetness of the Grecian customs” (p. 42).

Three questions arise from her interpretation. The title Salmacida Spolia has an association with the Greek/Roman myth of Hermaphroditus. When Hermaphroditus was swimming in the spring, a nymph Salmacis, who fell in love with him, clung unto him fast. Utterly denied by him, she prayed unto the gods that she and he might never be parted. Her prayer was answered and their bodies joined in one. Finding that his limbs were weakened and he was half a man, he prayed to his parents that whoever comes to this well may be so weakened there that of a man but half a man he may retire. Thus Salmacis, the spring, originally had an unknown strength to make a man half a man, but it did not have “sweetness” mentioned in the story. Another question is whether Amazons are civilized. Aren’t Amazons barbarians? Amazons are “mythical race of female warriors”. The name was popularly understood as “breastless” (maza is breast) and Apollodorus tells the story that they “pinched out” or “cauterized” the right breast so as not to impede their javelin-throwing (Apollodorus 2. 5. 8, Strabo II, 5. 1).

Snook interpretes “the Queen’s fair beauty as the perfected cure that counters
the limitations of the recipes of the anti-masque. Queen Henrietta Maria possesses
the social authority the physician lacks.” (p. 44) However eagerly Snook argues that
Queen's fair beauty is the perfected cure, she ignores the historical background that
Charles I married a Catholic Henrietta Maria, who was allowed to keep her Catholic
religion and had brought a household of hundreds of servants from France with her,
and attracted people around to convert to Catholicism. Thus she was one of the
causes of anxiety and disorder among the subjects. The Queen simply could not be
the uniting and consoling existence in England, which had been a Protestant country
since Henry VIII broke with Rome in the 16th century, except in the reign of Mary I.

In Aphra Behn's Wandering Beauty (1688), Arabella Fairname's fair skin is “both a sign
of her gentle birth and a political force”. Arabella, a pretty, well-born Royalist maid
runs away from home to escape from a forced marriage. She disguises herself as the
daughter of a husbandman, and also darkens her skin with walnut juice. Her fair skin
and medical expertise allow her to find her own more suitable match and be reunited
with her parents. Behn's narrative is directly connected to Stuart politics, namely
another famous fair wanderer Charles II. Whiteness embodies both the privilege of
class and of historical loyalty to the crown. Snook concludes that in Salmacida Spolia,
The Queen's Closet Opened and The Wandering Beauty, “fair beauty is being naturalized as
a claim to social power and epistemological privilege, authorized by the strategies of
authority, unique to each literary form” (p. 60).

Chapter 3 “The Greatness in Good Clothes: Fashioning Subjectivity in Mary
Wroth's Urania and Margaret Spencer's Account Book” focuses on the tale of Nereana
in The Countess of Montgomery's Urania (1621), which is persistently attentive to the
social functions of dress, and Margaret Spencer's account book (c. 1610-1613) which
dокументs her personal expenses. The tale of Nereana is “a psychological and erotic
quest that turns on the loss and restoration of clothing”. In early modern England,
clothes were assumed to be active in fashioning not just the body and social identity,
but inward states as well. Both texts suggest “female subjectivity” constituted by dress.

Snook argues that clothes reveal inward states, but clothes also create them in
Wroth's narrative. When Nereana first appears at Pamphilia's court, she and her
retainers are all dressed in tawny as the man whom she loves was dressed in that
colour. She is proud, and has the tendency of assuming overweening political power
and absolutism. Leaving the court, she gets lost in a forest, and is captured by Alanius,
who believes she is the nymph he loves. He ties her to a tree, undoes her hair and
leaves her nothing but a little petticoat of carnation taffeta to make her amenable to
him by transforming her into a wood nymph, as he assumes clothing fashions within.
Though her pride remains intact at first, and she reminds herself of her class identity, with her clothes stripped and denuded of social identity, along with subsistence on a diet of berries, herbs, roots and so on, her psychology is transformed and she becomes more self-effacing. Though she is rescued, changes clothes, and regains her accustomed humours, she is again tested, and ultimately learns self-governance. Her reform is marked in her dress. Nereana, having abandoned both her psychological pride and her political absolutism, proves “an excellent Governess, and brave Lady”.

Though the manuscript of Margaret Spencer’s account book reveals little of the writer’s emotional life, it documents connections between clothes, wealth, status and social relationships. She is one of seven siblings and a daughter of Robert Spencer, 1st Baron Spencer (created Baron Spencer of Wormleighton in 1603, though Snook writes 1600), who was said to have the most reserves of ready money as there were several contemporaries wealthier than him, though Snook describes him as the richest man in England at the accession of James I in 1603. Cataloguing her income and expenses between August 1611 and July 1613, her largest category of expense is clothes, which over the two years comes to about £105 18s 4d. Clothing costs amount to nearly 86 per cent of the money she receives. When Edmund Spenser, who claims a connection to this Spencer family in his poem, became Lord Grey’s secretary in 1580, his annual income was £20. Though Snook writes Margaret Spencer is “relatively wealthy”, we should think she is “very, very wealthy”. The most expensive purchase of a single item is a white beaver hat and hatband, for which she pays £3. This is almost certainly a product of colonial trade. Pointing out that early modern conduct books codified female chastity through the rejection of foreign fabrics and styles as foreign cloth undermines England’s virtue and the domestic wool industry, Snook argues that Margaret Spencer has access to “an insubordinate version of female subjectivity” and her account book shows it.

In Chapter 4 “What not to wear: Children’s Clothes and the Maternal Advice of Elizabeth Jocelin and Brilliana, Lady Harley”, Snook discusses Jocelin’s advice written on her deathbed before her daughter’s birth, and printed posthumously as The Mother’s Legacie: To her Unborne Childre (1624), and Lady Harley’s advice which survives in the form of a small manuscript advice book and numerous letters to her son she sent with clothes and food when he was a student at Oxford, and when he was in military service.

Snook introduces a brief history of laws and regulations in the Tudor period, when the Crown and the government regulated clothes by laws and proclamations. Regulations were meant accurately “to testify to the subject’s place within hierarchies of age, class and gender” (p. 90). The laws also regulated the young. Elizabeth’s
proclamation of 1562 targeted the apparel of students especially at Cambridge and Oxford, and Inns of Court, though both universities sought to govern dress independent of royal administration. Church was influential and "An Homely Against Excesse of Apparel" in the Elizabethan volume of homilies was printed repeatedly in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. "The sermon provides four rules for dressings: Christians should 'moderate temperance' to control the flesh, avoid inordinate care for the things of the body to attend to those of the spirit, be accountable to God for the good use of what He has given and be content with one's appointed degree. A man should live within the economic and social boundaries to which he has been born." (p. 90) Conduct books which told what to wear, and sermons at church issued at the request of monarchs highlight the magnitude of clothing's social functions.

Conduct books written by fathers for their sons including James I's advice about Prince Henry's dress in Basilikon Doron, and Sir Walter Ralegh's advice in one sentence not to pay too much attention to clothes in Sir Walter Ralegh's Instructions to his Sonne and to Posterity reflect the teaching of the sermons. Maternal advice by Elizabeth Jocelin and Lady Harley was born within a culture in which monarchs and the church attempted discursively to constitute the meaning of clothing. Snook shows that Jocelin tells "morally appropriate clothing is defined by the immediate social context rather than an absolute assessment of what is right and wrong" (p. 100), using the terms which are throughout early modern ecclesiastical, constitutional, discourse.

Snook and other scholars are resentful because Thomas Goad [Goad], who edited Jocelin's holograph version and printed it, changed her words and expressions to lower Jocelin, who was an heiress and had received a humanistic education. However, Goad also altered some of the ecumenical views when he translated works of the former Roman Catholic Archbishop Antonio de Dominis. He may have changed what did not suit his taste, not necessarily because he wanted to lower women.

Chapter 5 "The Culture of the Head: Hair in Mary Wroth's Urania and Margaret Cavendish's 'Assaulted and Pursued Chastity'" focuses on natural hair. Mary Wroth's The Countess of Montgomery's Urania (1621) develops the theory that "hair is a reliable sign of class identity", and "aristocratic characters have the same natural hair: slightly curled, thick and, often but not always, blonde" (p. 125). Urania tells the story of Leonius, a prince of Naples with aristocratic hair who dresses as a woman to win his beloved shepherdess Veralinda, whose own natural hair foreshadows the revelation that she is a princess of Frigia. "Assaulted and Pursued Chastity" printed in Nature's Picture Drawn by Fancies Pencil (1656, 1671) by Margaret Cavendish, Duchess of Newcastle
upon Tyne recounts the adventures of Miseria, a gentle woman in exile, who lands in the Kingdom of Sensuality, where she escapes attempted rape by the Prince. The Prince disguises himself as a woman to woo her, and she escapes by disguising herself as a boy and renaming herself Travellia. Shipwrecked in the Kingdom of Fantasy, where social ranks are marked in both hair and skin colour, she awes the inhabitants with her hair. Leaving the Kingdom, captured by pirates, she fights for the Queen she serves against the Prince, and eventually marries the Prince. They determine he “should govern her, and she would govern the Kingdom”.

Snook argues that “Cavendish and Wroth construct hair’s privilege with structures of class and race assembled from aesthetics and medical theories about hair’s physiology; in each case, their representations on hair reinforce hierarchies of class and race to challenge women’s subordinate position within particular culture.” (p. 116)

Chapter 6 “An Absolute Mistris of Her Self”, is about the hair of Ann Clifford, Countess of Pembroke, Dorset, and Montgomery, who was a diarist and formidable combatant in the lengthy inheritance dispute that ensued when her father George Clifford, the Earl of Cumberland, bequeathed his estates to his brother Francis Clifford. Snook writes “her father...bequeathed his estates to his brother...rather than to her”, and readers may be enticed to find a feminist problem here. However, the fact is that Cumberland, who was notorious for his extravagance and infidelity, had borrowed money from his brother, and bequeathed his estates to cover his debts (cf. Peter Holmes “George Clifford”, Oxford DNB, 2004-2013).

Snook compares the records of hair-related purchases in an account book when she was young (1600-1602) and a second account book when she was older (1665, 1667-1668), reads entries of these account books through the lens of portraits in “The Great Picture”, a triptych commissioned by Clifford in 1646, and The Great Books of Record, a collection of documents tracing the Clifford family history from the Norman Conquest onwards and her account books, and argues that she understood her hair as a component of her changing relationship to her inheritance and to luxury. Her hair denotes first the legitimate possession of luxury goods suitable to her status as the daughter of the Earl and Countess of Cumberland (Snook writes Earl and Countess of Westmorland, but his title is Earl of Cumberland, and Westmorland is not Earl but Baron) and then her disciplined self. Snook points out that whereas her portrait in “The Great Picture” at the age of 15, in the year of her father’s death, draws attention to “the richness of her clothing”, from the headdress of jewels to the sea-water green satin gown, in the portrait of Anne Clifford as Countess of Pembroke in The Great Book of Record after she has inherited her father’s property with the death of her cousin.
in 1643, she appears in a black gown made of satin and adorned with pearls. The very format of “The Great Picture” represents Clifford “as a widow”, depicting “the wife’s role as preserver of her husband’s memory” by placing her beside portraits of her deceased husbands.

Anne Clifford had lost beauty when she contracted small pox after her first husband died. Snook’s opinion that “widowhood is for Anne Clifford less a marital state than a state of mind, rather an identity that she inhabited long before she actually became a widow” is interesting. It is implied in another portrait. The portrait of “Philip Herbert, 4th Earl of Pembroke and his family”, shows her in black, “not making eye contact with any other people”. The fact that “Clifford reached an agreement with Pembroke in December 1634 which ensured her possession of the Westmorland lordships…. Soon after they had a great quarrel… and he banished her from London. For eight years she and Lady Isabella lived at his Wiltshire houses” (cf. Richard T. Spence, “Anne Clifford”, Oxford DNB, 2004-2013) supports her opinion.

When she was older, she covered and eventually shaved off her hair, and her baldness covered by a cap comes to document her power. While “early account books told the story of her obligation to her parents and kin, the later account book tells of her obligation to her households and her history”. Snook concludes that the more ascetic approach in her older age is not a rejection of luxury but a demonstration of her control of goods and herself, her autonomy and her place outside the patriarchal economy of commodification and desire, “She is Mistris of her Self”, quoting a phrase from the Bishop of Carlisle’s funeral sermon for her, which repeatedly touched on her appearance, suggesting that it was eccentric but a component of her power.

Research with materials of early printings and manuscripts is interesting. However, it is regrettable Snook sometimes does not pay enough attention to history or literary history, and occasional inaccuracy in dates and so on, together with repetition of her own views makes her opinion less convincing.

塩谷清人著『ダニエル・デフォーの世界』

世界思想社 2011年 I v + 422 pp.

1791年、ジェイムズ・ボズウェルは、『サミュエル・ジョンソン伝』を刊行するにあたり、自らの伝記執筆の意義を、フランシス・ベイコンがカエサルの『箴言集』について