A Direction of “mahāyāna” in the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*: Alteration of Text and its Intention

SHŌJI Fumio

1. Introduction

Existing two lineages in the Tibetan translations of *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* (hereafter abbr. ASP) is very important from the standpoint of how formed *Mahāyāna sūtras*. Previous research on this problem, I pointed out it (Shoji 2009). However, published data on the how to formed *Mahāyāna sūtras* is limited. In order to predict the formation process of *Mahāyāna sūtras*, it is important to model the case of ASPs. This work was done to alter the text in ASPs and its intention, and its purpose is to clear the formation process of *Mahāyāna sūtras*.

2. Texts and its Classification¹⁾

In this paper, we use the texts of Tibetan translations of ASP (‘*Phags pa shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa brgyad stong pa*) as follows:

- C: Cone xylograph Kanjur; No.1001 vol.77 Ka 1b1–386a8.
- D: Derge xylograph Kanjur; No.12 vol.33 Ka 1b1–286a6.
- Fa: Phug brag manuscript Kanjur; No.838 Ka 1b1–361/362/438a9.
- Fb: Phug brag manuscript Kanjur; No.839 Ka 1b1–120a, 120b–121a, 121b–190a, 190b–249/250–321, 322 missing, 323–381a, 381b–407a6.
- Fc: Phug brag manuscript Kanjur; No.840 Ka 1b1–16/ 17–147/148–183a, 183b–310/311–330/331–372a7.
- H: Lhasa xylograph Kanjur; No.11 vol. 29 Ka 1–450a4.
- K: Kawaguchi collection (Toyo Bunko); Zogai No.334 Ka 1a1–289b7.
- L: Sher dkar (London) manuscript Kanjur; No.647 vol. (= mss box no.) 101 Ka 1b1–364a4.
- N: Narthang xylograph Kanjur; No.13 vol.33 Ka 1b1–462a2.
- P: Peking (Otani University) xylograph Kanjur; No.734 vol. 48 (vol. 12, rep.) Mi 1a1–312a8.
- S: Stog Palace manuscript Kanjur; No.15 vol.50 Ka 1b1–407b4.
- T: Tokyo (Toyo Bunko) manuscript Kanjur; No.31 vol.44 Ka 1b1–354a8.

3. The Comparative Texts

In the first place, we describe a different point that lies between the two lineages, ASPA (= Recension A) and ASPB (= Recension B) by the method of to compare the texts about mahāyāna’s directions in ASPA with ASPB. For a while, we give common number for each paragraph (ex. ¶1–23).

ASPA

[¶1] de nas bcom ldan ’das la tshe dang
ldan pa rab ’byor gyis ’di skad ces gsol to//
[¶2] bcom ldan ’das ji ltar na/ byang chub
sems dpa’ sems dpa’ chen po go cha chen po
bgos pas theg pa chen po la yang dag par
zhugs shing/ theg pa chen po la yang dag par
’tshal ba lags/ [¶3] *theg pa chen po de gang
lags/ [¶4] theg pa chen po de gang du yang
dag par zhugs/ [¶5] theg pa chen po de gang
du gnas par ’gyur/ [¶6] *theg pa chen po de
gang na gnas par ’gyur/ [¶7] theg pa chen po
de gang nas negs par ’byung bar ’gyur/

[¶9] de skad ces gsol ba dang/ bcom ldan
’das kyis tshe dang ldan pa rab ’byor la ’di
skad ces bka’ stsal to// [¶10] rab ’byor theg
pa chen po zhes bya ba ’di ni/ dpag tu med
pa’i tshig bla dags so// rab ’byor dpag tu med
pa zhes bya ba ’di ni gzhal du med pa’i phyir
ro// [¶11] rab ’byor gang ’di skad du [¶13]
theg pa chen po gang nas nges par ’byung
bar ’gyur zhes zer ba ni/ [¶17] khams gsum
nas nges par ’byung bar ’gyur te/ [¶18] sgrib
pa med pa gang na ba der yang dag par zhugs
shing [¶19] thams cad mkhyen pa nyid la
gnas par ’gyur te/ [¶23] theg pa des gang
yang nges par ma byung nges par mi ’byung/
nges par ’byung bar mi ’gyur ro//

(Fc21a4; K15a7; L17b6; T16b6)

ASPB²⁾

[¶1] de nas bcom ldan ’das la tshe dang
ldan pa rab ’byor gyis ’di skad ces gsol to//
[¶2] bcom ldan ’das de ltar byang chub sems
dpa’ sems dpa’ chen po go cha chen po bgos
par gyur pa theg pa chen po la yang dag par
zhugs shing theg pa chen po la yang dag par
gnas par ’gyur ba’i [¶3] theg pa chen po de
ni gang lags/ [¶4] theg pa chen po de la ji
ltar yang dag par zhugs par rig par bgyi ba
’am/ [¶5] theg pa chen po des gang nas nges
par ’byung bar ’gyur ba ’am/ [¶6] theg pa
chen po de la gang gis yang dag par zhugs pa
’am/ [¶7] theg pa chen po des gang du gnas
par ’gyur ba ’am/ [¶8] theg pa chen po des
gang zhig nges par ’byung bar ’gyur/

[¶9] de skad ces gsol ba dang/ bcom ldan
’das kyis tshe dang ldan pa rab ’byor la ’di
skad ces bka’ stsal to// [¶10] rab ’byor theg
pa chen po zhes bya ba ’di ni gzhal du med
pa’i tshig bla dags so// rab ’byor gzhal du
med pa zhes bya ba ’di ni tshad med pa’i
phyir ro// [¶11] rab ’byor gang yang ’di skad
du [¶12] theg pa chen po de la ji ltar yang
dag par zhugs par rig par bgyi ba ’am/ [¶13]
theg pa chen po des gang nas nges par
’byung bar ’gyur ba ’am/ [¶14] theg pa chen
po de la gang gis yang dag par zhugs pa ’am/
[¶15] theg pa chen po des gang du gnas par
’gyur ba ’am/ [¶16] theg pa chen po des
gang zhig nges par ’byung bar ’gyur zhes zer
ba ni/ [¶17] pha rol tu phyin pa rnam kyi sgo

(86) A Direction of “mahāyāna” in the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* (F. SHŌJI)

* Fc omits paragraph of [¶3] and [¶6].

nas yang dag par zhugs nas/ [¶18] kham
gsum nas nges par 'byung bar 'gyur zhing /
[¶19] mi dmigs pa gang yin pas yang dag
par zhugs te/ [¶20] thams cad mkhyen pa
nyid du gnas par 'gyur la/ [¶21] byang chub
sems dpa' sems dpa' chen po nges par
'byung bar 'gyur te/ [¶22] 'on kyang gang
nas kyang nges par 'byung ba med gang gis
kyang yang dag par ma zhugs/ gang du yang
gnas par mi 'gyur mod kyi gnas pa med pa'i
tshul gyis thams cad mkhyen pa nyid la gnas
par 'gyur la/ [¶23] theg pa chen po des gang
yang nges par ma byung nges par 'byung bar
yang mi 'gyur nges par phyung ba yang med
de/ (C17a8; D13a5; Fa21b4; Fb18a7; H;
N20a4; P13b5; S18a2)

Thus, the questions about mahāyāna by Subhūti and its answers by Bhagavat are different between ASPA and ASPB, i.e. ¶12–17, 21 and 22 are omitted in ASPA. On account of Haribhadra's interpretation (AAA),³⁾ the following points should be noteworthy.

- (1) Haribhadra's interpretation based on texts of ASPB/S, not ASPA.
- (2) Description of the six questions in AAV (by Ārya-Vimuktisena) was quoted in AAA.

Secondly, we should notice the Ārya-Vimuktisena's interpretation, AAV. As a result, Ārya-Vimuktisena referred to the five questions about mahāyāna's direction, but its differ from the AAA, because of Haribhadra referred to the six questions as description of AAV.⁴⁾ And further, the five questions of Ārya-Vimuktisena based on the text of PVSP.⁵⁾ On this problem, it should be noted that the BAA (by Jagaddalanivāsin) has referred to two versions of ASPs. According to that explanation, the old version of ASP (*sngar gyi po ti* = ASPA) had no texts enough for the system of AA (*mNgon par rtogs pa*), therefore the texts was added based on the AAV at later time.⁶⁾ And BAA referred to similar to AAV, the five questions, not six.

4. Conclusion

- (1) On mahāyāna's directions, Haribhadra (AAA) interprets it similar to Ārya-Vimuktisena's interpretations (AAV) bases on ASPB/S.

- (2) On same topics, Ārya-Vimuktisena interprets it bases on PVSP, therefore there are different points between AAA and AAV.
- (3) According to BAA’s interpretation, the texts of ASPs were altered by to agree with AAV’s interpretation.
- (4) As a result, the texts on mahāyāna’s directions in ASPs were altered as follows:
 ASPA → PVSP → ASPB/S
- (5) That is to say, we can know that, the alteration’s purpose for ASP, is to agree well with AA’s system.

Notes

- 1) According to Peter Skilling, the existing Tibetan Kanjurs are classified into four lines of descent: (a) of independent lineage, (b) of the *Tshal pa* lineage, (c) of the *Them spangs ma* lineage, and (d) of mixed lineage (Skilling 1994, xxv ff.). Based on his study, Tibetan translations of the ASP will be grouped as follows: (a) Fa; Fb; Fc, (b) C; P, (c) L; S; T, (d) D; H; N.

Here, if we try to mix the classification by Skilling 1994 with Shoji 2009 of ASPs as follows:

	(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)
ASPA	Fc		LT	
ASPB	FaFb	CP	S	DHN

In addition, we can use golden manuscript of Tibetan translation of ASP collected by Ekai Kawaguchi in the Toyo Bunko, Tokyo (= K), its classified in ASPA group.

- 2) ASPB is agree with ASPS (ASP [Skt.]: Mitra 1888, 23.5; Vaidya, 1960, 11.31; Wogihara 1932–35, 94.2. [Tr.]: Conze 1958, 9).
- 3) AAA [Skt.]: Tucci 1932, 88.21; Vaidya 1960, 314.11; Wogihara 1932–35, 94. [Tib.]: C58b6; D55b7; G78a5; N62a3; P68b6. [Tr.]: Sparham 2006, 281. Moreover, Ratnākaraśānti (SU: C34a1; D33b7; G46a3; N37b4 ; P37a8) and Abhayākara Gupta (MK: C66a1; D53b6; G74b6; N61a1; P61b8) referred similar to Haribhadra, the six questions.
- 4) AAV [Skt.]: Pensa 1967, 94. [Tib.]: C75b2; D71a3; G97b5; N75a7; P81b3. [Tr.]: Sparham 2006, 107. Moreover, Vimuktisena (AAKV: C49b4; D46a7; G66a3; N48b5; P55a6) and Ratnākaraśānti (SM: C108a1; D108a1; G156b4; N114a5; P124a2) referred similar to Ārya-Vimuktisena, the five questions. Haribhadra didn’t describe the five or six questions in his AASV (Amano 2000, 26–27 (Skt. MSS missing); C96a5; D91a4; G125b5; N101b2; P107b3).
- 5) PVSPS [Skt.]: Dutt 1934, 194; Kimura 2009, 58. PVSPK [Tib. Kanjur]: D (Ka) 220a3; P (Nyi) 223a3. PVSP [Tib. Tanjur]: C220b5; D213b2; G297a4; N230b5; P241b1.
- 6) ’og nas kyang dri ba dang rjes su brjod pa la sogs pa’i ngag mams la yang [¶4] *ji ltar de la yang dag par zhugs par rig par bya’o zhes pa dang/ de bzhin du* [¶16] *pha rol tu phyin pa rnams kyis yang dag par zhugs pa zhes bya ba dang/ de bzhin du* [¶21] *byang chub sems dpa’*

(88) A Direction of “mahāyāna” in the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* (F. SHŌJI)

sems dpa' chen po nges par 'byung ba zhes bya ba dang/ [¶22] 'on kyang gang nas kyang nges par 'byung ba ma yin/ gang gis kyang yang dag par zhugs pa ma yin/ gang du yang gnas par mi 'gyur mod kyi 'on kyang gnas med pa'i tshul gyis thams cad mkhyen pa nyid la gnas par 'gyur la zhes bya ba 'don pa yin te/ 'don pa 'di thams cad sngar gyi po ti rnams la med de legs par 'brel ba'i don med pas de'i phyir bzahag pa nyid do// slar yang bzahag pa'i rgyu gang yin zhe na/ 'phags pa rnam grol sde'i 'grel pa las dri ba rnam pa lnga ste/ [¶3] byang chub sems dpa'i theg pa chen po ni gang lags/ [¶4] ji ltar na de la yang dag par zhugs par rig par bgyi zhes bya ba la sogs pa 'don no// de ltar yang mngon par rtogs pa dang sbyar ba bde blag pa yin pa'i phyir 'don pa de der rigs (its read rig) pa yin no// bcom ldan 'das ma de la theg pa chen po la yang dag par zhugs pa nyid kyi sngar dris pa med pa'i phyir ro// 'di la ni [¶12] ji ltar theg pa chen po la yang dag par zhugs pa zhes bya ba sngar nyid du dris pa'o// gal te yang ji ltar gyi sgra bsal nas 'di ltar zhes bya ba bzahag pa de ltar na yang 'brel ba med pa nyid do// (BAA: C49b4; D48a4; G64a2; N51a3; P54a5)

Abbreviations

AA: *Abhisamayālaṃkāra*. AAA: Haribhadra, *Abhisamayālaṃkāralokā Prajñāpāramitāvyākhyā* (= [Skt.] Vaidya 1960; Wogihara 1932–35, [Tib.] D3791; P5189). AAKV: *Vimuktisena, *'Phags pa shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa stong phrag nyi shu lnga pa'i man ngag gi bstan bcos mngon par rtogs pa'i rgyan gyi tshig le'ur byas pa'i rnam par 'grel pa* (= [Tib.] D3788; P5186). AASV: Haribhadra, *Abhisamayālaṃkāra-kārikā-śāstra-vivṛti* (= [Skt.] Amano 2000, [Tib.] D3793; P5191). AAV: Ārya-Vimuktekisena, *Abhisamayālaṃkāravṛtti* (= [Skt.] Pensa 1967, [Tib.] D3787; P5185). ASPA: *'Phags pa shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa brgyad stong pa* (= Fc; K; L; T). ASPB: *ibid.* (= C; D; Fa; Fb; H; N; P; S; U). ASPS: *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* ([Skt.] = Wogihara 1932–35; Vaidya 1960). BAA: Jagaddalanivāsin, **Bhagavatyaṃnāyānusāriṇi-nāma-vyākhyā* (= [Tib.] D3811; P5209). MK: Abhayākaragupta, *'Phags pa shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa brgyad stong pa'i 'grel pa gnad kyi zla ba'i 'od ces bya ba* (= [Tib.] D3805; P5202). PVSPK: *Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa stong phrag nyi shu lnga pa.* (= [Tib.] D9; P731). PVSPS: *Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* (= [Skt.] Kimura 2009). PVSPT: *Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa stong phrag nyi shu lnga pa* (= [Tib.] D3790; P5188). SM: Ratnākaraśānti, *mNgon par rtogs pa'i rgyan gyi tshig le'ur byas pa'i 'grel pa dag ldan zhes bya ba* (= [Tib.] D3801; P5199). SU: Ratnākaraśānti, **Sārottamā* (= [Tib.] D3803; P5200).

References

- Amano, K. 2000, *Abhisamayālaṃkāra-kārikā-śāstra-vivṛti*. Kyoto: Heirakuji Shoten.
 Conze, E. 1958, *Astasahasrika prajnaparamita*. Calcutta: Asiatic Society.
 Kimura, T. 2009, *Pañcaviṃśatisāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā I-2*. Tokyo: Sankibo Busshorin.
 Mitra, R. 1888, *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*. Calcutta: Bibliotheca Indica.
 Pensa, C. 1967, *L'Abhisamayālaṃkāravṛtti di Ārya Vimuktisena*. SOR XXXVII, Roma.
 Shoji, F. 2009, “A classification of the *'Phags pa Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa brGyad stong*

A Direction of “mahāyāna” in the *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā* (F. SHŌJI) (89)

pa.” *The Journal of the History of Buddhism*, 52 (1), pp.1–22.

Skilling, P. 1994, *Mahāsūtras Vol.I*. Oxford: Pali Text Society.

Sparham, G. 2006, *Ahisamayālaṃkāra with Vṛtti and Ālokā Vṛtti by Ārya vimuktisena Ālokā by Haribhadra, Volume one First Abhisamaya*. California: Jain Publishing company Fremont.

Tucci, G. 1932, *The Abhisamayāraṅkāralokā, being a commentary on the Abhisamayālaṅkāra of Maitreyanātha and the Aṣṭasāhasrikāprajñāpāramitā*. Gaekward’s Sanskrit Series No.62, vol.1. Baroda.

Wogihara, U. 1932–35, *Abhisamayālaṃkāralokā Prajñāpāramitāvyākhyā*. Tokyo: Tōyō Bunko.

Vaidya, P.L. 1960, *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*. Dharbhanga: The Mithila Institute of Post-Graduate Studies and Research in Sanskrit Learning.

〈Key words〉 mahāyāna, *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā*, *Abhisamayālaṃkāra*

(Part-time Lecturer, Rissho University)