Field Study

Poor Mental Health Associated with Job Dissatisfaction among School Teachers in Japan

Michiko Nagai¹, Kenji J. Tsuchiya²,³, Timothea Toulopoulou⁴ and Nori Takei²,⁴

¹Department of Psychiatric Nursing, ²Osaka-Hamamatsu Joint Research Center for Child Mental Development, ³Department of Psychiatry and Neurology, Hamamatsu University School of Medicine, Japan and ⁴Division of Psychological Medicine, Institute of Psychiatry, UK

Abstract: Poor Mental Health Associated with Job Dissatisfaction among School Teachers in Japan: Michiko Nagai, et al. Department of Psychiatric Nursing, Hamamatsu University School of Medicine—School teaching is regarded as a stressful occupation. The present study aimed to compare the likelihood of having minor psychiatric disorders (MPD) among school teachers with that among civil servants, and to investigate what factors were specifically associated with MPD in teachers. We conducted a questionnaire-based survey of 403 teachers employed at state schools and 611 civil servants as a comparison group in a medium-sized city in Japan. The response rate was 59.6% for teachers and 62.0% for civil servants. Mental health was assessed using the 28-item General Health Questionnaire (GHQ-28), according to which those with a score of six or higher were considered to have MPD. Logistic regression analysis was used to identify the factors associated with MPD. Although the proportion of subjects with MPD among teachers was greater than that among civil servants, the difference in the proportion was not statistically significant in the multiple logistic regression analysis adjusted for potential confounders. In a separate analysis of the teachers, reduced job satisfaction and shorter time spent of leisure were significantly associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD. In the group of civil servants, longer working hours, reduced life satisfaction, a history of sick leave, and physical illness were associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD. When this analysis was conducted separately for male and female teachers, job dissatisfaction alone was associated with MPD only in female teachers. Poor mental health of Japanese school teachers, female teachers in particular, was found to be associated with job dissatisfaction. (J Occup Health 2007; 49: 515–522)

Key words: Mental health, Occupational health, Stress, Job satisfaction

It has been suggested that school teachers are exposed to highly stressful situations, which are related to psychological and psychiatric problems¹. Statistics have suggested that psychological and psychiatric problems have been of increasing concern; the occurrence of individuals taking sick leave due to psychiatric problems increased from 0.11% in 1993 to 0.39% in 2004²,³. Accounts of worsening mental health among Japanese teachers include students’ misbehavior⁴,⁵. School surveys conducted of school students and pupils in recent years have revealed that the occurrence of those who refuse to go to school has nearly doubled in a period of ten years (0.17% in 1993 vs. 0.33% in 2003 for elementary school children; 1.24% in 1993 vs. 2.73% in 2003 for junior high school students)⁶,⁷. Furthermore, in junior high schools, acts of violence by students directed at teachers and other students were found to have increased approximately four-fold over the period from 1994 to 1998⁸. Therefore, it is reasonable to assume that, under such circumstances, teachers may be placed in stressful situations.

In addition to this, work overload for teachers has been an area of concern in Western countries⁹,¹⁰ as well as in Japan¹¹. In Japan, a policy to reduce teachers’ workload took effect in April 2002. The curricula were rearranged to reduce teaching hours and teachers have been strongly recommended to comply with a five-day a week system. However, Japanese teachers may have been required to prepare classes while abiding by revised teaching guidelines within the curricula. This requirement has
added to the job demands made on Japanese teachers.

Other work characteristics and psychosocial factors, such as job insecurity, effort-reward imbalances, job dissatisfaction, and compromised general health have been proposed as stressors for teachers\(^2,9-12\), as well as for civil servants\(^13-16\), particularly female civil servants\(^13,17\). These studies suggest that factors that may worsen mental health status include occupation as well as many other factors including demographic factors.

Unfortunately, there is no quantitative data suggesting which factors contribute to improving the mental health of Japanese teachers, nor have there been any prior studies that have directly compared the factors associated with mental health disturbances between teachers and workers in other occupations in Japan. In light of this, we felt it crucial to find the factors associated with psychological/psychiatric problems in school teachers in Japan using an appropriate reference professional group.

**Aims of the study**

We compared the proportion of subjects with minor psychiatric disorders (MPD) as a proxy for mental health status among Japanese teachers using a standardized measure, with that of civil servants as a referent group. We hypothesized that the proportion is higher in teachers than in civil servants. We also sought what factors, if any, would be specifically associated with MPD in teachers.

**Methods**

**Subjects**

From February to March 2000, we conducted a survey of teachers in a city (since 2005 the city has been integrated into a neighboring city) in Shizuoka Prefecture, which is located at the center of mainland Japan; the city had a population of approximately 80,000 and had 12 elementary schools and 5 junior high schools in the year 2000. As a comparison group of workers with another occupation, we enrolled civil servants who worked in the city on the grounds that their social status and occupation, we enrolled civil servants who worked in other occupations in Japan. In light of this, we felt it crucial to find the factors associated with psychological/psychiatric problems in school teachers in Japan using an appropriate reference professional group.

**Mental health assessment**

To identify mental health problems among the subjects, the questionnaire included the Japanese version of the 28-item General Health Questionnaire (GHQ-28), originally developed by Goldberg and colleagues\(^9\), which was translated into Japanese and standardized by Nakagawa and colleagues\(^20\). The total score ranges from 0 to 28 and higher scores represent poorer mental health. In accordance with the procedure applied in previous studies, we used a cut-off point of 6, and we defined those individuals with a score of 6 or more as having a minor psychiatric disorder (MPD)\(^9-21\). The GHQ-28 is composed of four subscales (range for each: 0–7); somatic symptoms, anxiety and insomnia, social dysfunction, and severe depression.

**Demographic variables and factors that possibly increase the likelihood of having MPD in teachers and civil servants**

The demographic variables examined were age, sex, and marital status. We also examined the following factors that may influence the occurrence of MPD: working hours, sickness leave (number of days during the last 6 months), physical illness, sleeping hours, time spent with family, and time spent on leisure activities. Three psychometric scales were also included in the questionnaire to assess job satisfaction, life satisfaction and problem-solving ability. The job and life satisfaction scales are composed of 15 questions each, with a seven-point Likert-type scoring system (1=extremely dissatisfied, 7=extremely satisfied). Both of the satisfaction scores range from 15 to 105, with higher scores indicating higher levels of satisfaction\(^22\). Problem-solving ability was evaluated with the Problem-Solving Inventory (PSI)\(^23\) to assess the personal problem-solving process. The PSI consists of 32 items with a six-point, Likert-type scoring system for each item (range: 32–192). Lower scores correspond to higher levels of ability to solve problems. The reliability coefficient (Cronbach’s alpha) was 0.95 for GHQ-28, 0.91 for job satisfaction, 0.87 for life satisfaction, and 0.85 for PSI in this sample studied. We opted for these factors on the basis that: 1) they have been studied in the related literature, 2) they are occupation-related factors, and 3) changes in the scores can be expected to improve (or worsen) mental health.
Analysis

After comparing demographic variables and factors of interest between the two occupational groups, we then analyzed whether age as either a categorical or continuous variable was associated with MPD, since it was expected to function as a confounder or effect-modifier in the associations between MPD and the other variables of our interest. A preliminary analysis revealed that there was no linear relationship between age as a continuous variable and the likelihood of having MPD; it showed an inverted U-shape. Therefore, we dealt with age as a categorical variable consisting of four age-bands (20 to 29 yr, 30 to 39 yr, 40 to 49 yr, and 50 yr and over); three dummy variables were entered into the logistic regression analyses as forced covariates. Likewise, sex was also treated as a potential confounder because more female than male subjects were likely to have MPD, as was indicated by our preliminary analysis.

Four of the continuous variables examined, i.e., working hours at office and at home, time spent with family and for leisure, were dichotomized in the analyses because they revealed a non-linear relationship to MPD in the preliminary data inspection.

Along with the primary aim of this study, the proportion of MPD in each group was then compared using a logistic regression analysis adjusted for age, sex and all variables available. Thereafter, we examined whether the factors of interest described above were associated with having MPD in each occupational group, separately.

To examine statistical associations between the factors of interest and the likelihood of having MPD in the subjects under investigation, we again employed logistic regression analyses to yield the odds ratios (ORs) in the two groups, separately, with a 95% confidence interval (CI), first in a model adjusted for age and sex. If an association was implied, i.e. the p-value was less than 0.25, this variable was selected and entered into further analyses. The selected variables, age and sex were entered into a multivariable, full model for the groups of teachers and civil servants, respectively. We used SPSS version 11.5J for Windows (SPSS, Chicago), statistical software, and \( p < 0.05 \) was considered statistically significant. In the comparison of a continuous variable between two groups, we used the Wilcoxon rank-sum test in anticipation of non-normal distributions. As for categorical variables, the chi-square test was applied.

Results

Demographic variables

Table 1 shows the characteristics of the teachers and civil servants. There were significant differences between the teachers and civil servants in terms of age (mean=39.7 vs. 41.4 yr for teachers and civil servants, respectively; \( p = 0.02 \)) and sex (proportion of female subjects: 48.3% vs. 19.5%; \( p < 0.001 \)). The proportion of those with a marital status other than married did not differ between the groups (\( p = 0.27 \)). The score on the GHQ-28 was significantly higher among the teachers than among the civil servants (mean: 8.2 vs. 6.3 points; \( p < 0.001 \)). Regarding the four subscales of the GHQ-28, teachers had significantly higher scores for the somatic symptoms (\( p < 0.001 \)) and anxiety and insomnia (\( p = 0.02 \)) subscales than civil servants. The other two subscales did not show any significant differences.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Civil servants</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N of subjects</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>379</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex: female</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>( \chi^2 = 57.33, \text{df}=1 ) ( p &lt; 0.001 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age (mean; median)</td>
<td>39.7; 39.0</td>
<td>41.4; 42.0</td>
<td>( z = 2.42 ) ( p = 0.02 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status: other than married</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>( \chi^2 = 1.21, \text{df}=1 ) ( p = 0.27 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHQ-28 (mean; median)</td>
<td>8.2; 7.5</td>
<td>6.3; 5.0</td>
<td>( z = 4.32 ) ( p &lt; 0.001 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subscales of GHQ-28</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somatic symptoms</td>
<td>3.7; 4.0</td>
<td>2.3; 2.0</td>
<td>( z = 6.83 ) ( p &lt; 0.001 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety and insomnia</td>
<td>2.5; 2.0</td>
<td>2.2; 2.0</td>
<td>( z = 2.33 ) ( p = 0.02 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social dysfunction</td>
<td>1.4; 1.0</td>
<td>1.2; 1.0</td>
<td>( z = 1.19 ) ( p = 0.24 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Severe depression</td>
<td>0.7; 0.0</td>
<td>0.6; 0.0</td>
<td>( z = 0.46 ) ( p = 0.65 )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Standard deviation.
Proportion of subjects with MPD for teachers and civil servants

The proportion of subjects with MPD among teachers was significantly greater than that among civil servants (62.9% vs. 46.4%; \( \chi^2 = 16.01, df = 1, p < 0.001 \)). A logistic regression analysis with an adjustment for age and sex showed a significant association (OR=1.55; 95%CI: 1.09 to 2.20; referent category: civil servants). When age, sex and all the variables we collected were controlled for, the statistical significance no longer persisted (OR=1.15; 95%CI: 0.61 to 2.19).

Identification of variables that possibly increase the likelihood of having MPD

We analyzed each factor of interest with an adjustment for age and sex using logistic regression analyses for teachers and civil servants, respectively. In the teacher’s group, the candidate factors possibly associated with MPD, i.e., the factors that showed a p-value of less than 0.25, included unmarried, longer working hours at home, shorter time spent with family, shorter time spent on leisure, lowered job satisfaction, lowered life satisfaction, lowered problem solving skill, presence of physical illness, sick leave, and decreased sleeping hours. These were entered into the multivariable, full model.

In the same analysis applied to civil servants, the candidate factors included longer working hours at the office, longer working hours at home, shorter time spent with family, shorter time spent on leisure, lowered job satisfaction, lowered life satisfaction, presence of physical illness, and sick leave. These variables, as well as age and sex, were selected and entered into another full model for the group of civil servants.

Determining factors that increase the likelihood of having MPD

Table 2 shows that, in the multivariable logistic regression analysis for the teachers, two variables remained statistically significant in the full model: lowered job satisfaction and shorter time spent on leisure.

For civil servants, the following variables remained statistically significant in the full model: longer working hours, lowered life satisfaction, shorter time spent on leisure, sick leave, and physical illness.

We repeated the same analyses conducted above for male and female subjects separately, for teachers and civil servants, respectively. For the male teachers, no variable remained statistically significant, whereas longer working hours (OR=2.23, 95%CI: 1.12 to 4.46), lowered life satisfaction (OR for 10-point decrease=1.38, 95%CI: 1.02 to 1.85), and history of sick leave (OR=1.92, 95%CI: 1.13 to 3.26) were all associated with MPD in male civil servants. In the female teacher group, lowered job satisfaction (OR for 10-point decrease=2.34, 95%CI: 1.23 to 4.46) was significantly associated with MPD, whereas lowered life satisfaction (OR for 10-point decrease=3.16, 95%CI: 1.05 to 9.56) and shorter time spent on leisure (OR=5.61, 95%CI: 1.07 to 29.5) were associated with MPD in female civil servants. Unexpectedly, shorter sleeping hours (OR=0.36, 95%CI: 0.13 to 0.97) were negatively associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD in female civil servants.

Discussion

To our knowledge, this is the first study focusing on occupational mental health problems in Japanese teachers with a reference group from another occupational group with a similar socioeconomic status.

The proportion of those with MPD in Japanese workers was shown to be high. Our sample of teachers showed an extremely high rate of MPD (62.9%), conventionally defined as a score of 6 points or higher on the GHQ-28. This proportion was much higher than those in studies exploring teachers as ranged from 50.8% to 53.8%25-27 and than those of nurses (37.0%) and general office workers (25.2%) in a study conducted in Japan29. However, the departure of our result from the findings of other studies should be interpreted cautiously, since non-respondent rates, the cut-off points for defining MPD, and the age distribution of the subjects has varied across studies.

We hypothesized that MPD may be more prevalent in teachers than in another occupational group, i.e., civil servants. However, there was no support for this hypothesis, since the likelihood of having MPD was not associated specifically with the group of school teachers after controlling for age, sex, and other covariates. As was expected, we found that the covariates we entered into the model exerted confounding effects, because the OR was reduced after controlling for the covariates. This implies that some of the covariates we collected other than age and sex may be more specifically associated with MPD in the teachers than they were in the civil servants.

In fact, we succeeded in finding variables associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD. However, the constellation of variables significantly associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD varied across the two occupational groups: job dissatisfaction and a shorter time spent on leisure among the teachers; longer working hours, lowered life satisfaction, a shorter time spent on leisure, sick leave, and the presence of physical illness among the civil servants (Table 2). It is fairly clear that in the group of civil servants, variables related to workload and physical illness are associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD. Studies have suggested that work characteristics such as high job demands, effort-reward imbalances, and chronic job insecurity have had an adverse effect on mental health among British civil servants14-16. Both working overtime
and “karoshi” (translated as “death due to overwork”) among male Japanese workers are of grave concern in Japan. With respect to properties such as high job demands and overwork, our results for the civil servants accord particularly well with the literature.

As regards school teachers, a previous study showed that the occurrence of psychiatric morbidity was correlated with the strength of stress among primary and secondary school teachers in South London. Another study reported that stress among teachers was associated with workload. Therefore, it could naturally be assumed that long working hours might be associated with MPD not only in the civil servants, but also in the teachers of the present study. Surprisingly, this was not confirmed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2. Variables that increase likelihood of having MPD&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TEACHERS**

Marital status unmaried 2.08 (0.51, 8.53) 0.31 Married
Working hours at home per week 1+ h 2.06 (0.65, 6.51) 0.22 0 h
Time spent with family per week <21h 1.37 (0.67, 2.82) 0.39 ≥21h
Time spent on leisure per week <5 h 2.08 (1.02, 4.25) 0.04 ≥5 h
Job satisfaction for 10-pt decrease 1.45 (1.04, 2.03) 0.03
Life satisfaction for 10-pt decrease 1.47 (0.98, 2.18) 0.06
Problem solving for 10-pt increase 1.17 (0.92, 1.49) 0.21
Physical illness present 1.65 (0.58, 4.69) 0.35 No physical illness
Sick leave during last 6 months 1+ d 1.72 (0.77, 3.83) 0.18 No sick leave
Sleeping hours per day for 1-h decrease 1.20 (0.75, 1.92) 0.45

**CIVIL SERVANTS**

Working hours at office per week >45 h 2.82 (1.43, 5.57) 0.003 ≥45 h
Working hours at home per week 1+ h 1.38 (0.72, 2.63) 0.33 0 h
Time spent with family per week <21h 0.79 (0.47, 1.32) 0.36 ≥21h
Time spent on leisure per week <5 h 1.85 (1.07, 3.21) 0.03 ≥5 h
Job satisfaction for 10-pt decrease 1.12 (0.89, 1.42) 0.33
Life satisfaction for 10-pt decrease 1.49 (1.13, 1.96) 0.005
Physical illness present 1.91 (1.05, 3.45) 0.03 No physical illness
Sick leave during last 6 months 1+ d 1.70 (1.05, 2.78) 0.03 No sick leave

<sup>a</sup>: Minor psychiatric disorder as measured by GHQ-28 score of six or more.
<sup>b</sup>: Adjusted for sex, age and all the variables with p<0.25 in the last analysis shown here.
for the teachers, even though they worked for significantly longer hours per week in the office (55.0 h) than the civil servants (42.5 h), much longer than the national averages in countries such as Japan (43.1 h), Hong Kong (46.6 h), and South Korea (47.5 h)\(^2\). The possible reasons for the non-significant association may be the inclusion of some teachers with MPD who cannot work long hours because of psychiatric morbidity and the exclusion of non-random missing information on subjects with MPD with long working hours; however, it remains possible that there is in fact no association between working hours and MPD among Japanese teachers. If this is true, other work-related factors may be concerned.

Job dissatisfaction was found to be associated with an increased likelihood of having MPD only in our sample of teachers. A study carried out in the UK suggested that increased job satisfaction protected the mental health of hospital consultants\(^3\), as is consistent with our results. Despite the difference in the populations studied, studies have suggested that job satisfaction among specialist professionals, including teachers, lecturers, pharmacists, physicians, etc., is associated with the effectiveness of resolution strategies in professional settings; in other words, how well the subject functions as a specialist professional\(^10,12,33\). Interestingly, Cockburn\(^10\) indicated that preparing classes is one of the most effective resolution strategies for teachers and that increased job satisfaction in teachers was highly related to their readiness for teaching classes. If this is the case, job satisfaction may be a proxy measure in part for readiness for teaching, the reduction of which may be connected with the increased likelihood of having MPD.

It would seem that the promotion of job satisfaction, rather than decreasing working hours, is crucial for improving the mental health of Japanese teachers. However, as was shown in the analyses conducted separately for male and female subjects, the association between decreased job satisfaction and the increased likelihood of having MPD was confirmed only in female teachers. One explanation is that this was a chance finding occurring only in female teachers, although other explanations can also be postulated, e.g., that Japanese female teachers are less likely to increase readiness for teaching than male teachers. Of note is that in our sample, the number of working hours differed significantly for female and male teachers (per week: females 53.7 h, males 56.2 h; \(z=2.4, p=0.02\)), suggesting that female teachers may have limited time to prepare classes. This is in line with the fact that, according to statistics\(^34\), the average hours spent attending to household affairs in women and men are quite different in Japan (hours per day in Japan: females 7.41 h, males 0.48 h; in the US: females 6.21 h, males 3.26 h).

Interestingly, a shorter time spent on leisure activities may increase the likelihood of having MPD in both occupational groups. The association remained statistically significant only in female civil servants after stratification by sex. This implies that increasing the amount of time spent on leisure activities may be an effective strategy for improving mental health status among female civil servants. The emerged associations of the variables specifically related to MPD among the teachers, i.e., job dissatisfaction and limited leisure time, all point to a suggestion that poor mental health status among school teachers can be improved with particular care for female teachers. We should be aware, however, that we are not allowed to assume causation because of a cross-sectional design, which is a limitation of the present study. Whether increasing job satisfaction is an effective measure can only be confirmed in longitudinal studies, since job dissatisfaction can also be an effect that stems from MPD.

With regards to the limitations other than the cross-sectional design, we are aware that the selection of the study subjects may have been inappropriate in two ways. First, the selection of civil servants as control subjects in comparison with teachers may be inappropriate because, according to a prior study\(^7\), mental health status among a group of civil servants was poorer than the normative data. Thus, we might have underestimated mental health issues among the teacher group. Second, in the separate analyses for the two groups of subjects, the estimates might have been biased due to possibly non-random missing information. Although the overall response rate in this study was comparable with that of similar types of other studies\(^35,36\), and the response rate did not differ between the two occupational groups, more subjects with MPD might have been excluded from the analyses because of missing information, leading the estimates to null values\(^37\).

Since lowered socioeconomic status is an established risk factor for depression\(^8\), we should have controlled for this factor as a potential confounder. In the present study, however, we learned from the official statistics that the mean annual income of the teachers and civil servants we examined were almost the same. Because all of the subjects are employed under the same regulations governing the salary system, we assume that the socioeconomic status does not differ much across the subjects.

Despite these limitations, Japanese school teachers were shown to suffer from poor mental health status as well as civil servants. Decreased job satisfaction and shorter time spent on leisure activities were factors associated with MPD among the teachers, especially the female teachers.

Acknowledgments: The authors would like to thank Professor Norio Mori of the Department of Psychiatry and Neurology, Hamamatsu University School of
Medical care for his helpful comments. We also appreciate the cooperation shown by the subjects who participated in this study.

References

31) Crolly M, Steptoe A and Joekes K: Job strain and psychiatric morbidity. Psychol Med 29, 1411–1416